# Exploring the QCD phase diagram with Taylor expansion and analytic continuation

**Christian Schmidt** 



HotQCD Collaboration, Phys.Rev.D 101 (2020) 7, 074502 and work in progress

- A. Bazavov, D. Bollweg, H.-T. Ding, P. Enns, J. Goswami, P. Hegde,
- O. Kaczmarek, F. Karsch, A. Lahiri, R. Larsen, S.-T. Li, Swagato Mukherjee,
- H. Ohno, P. Petreczky, C. Schmidt, S. Sharma, P. Steinbrecher

#### Bielefeld-Parma Collaboration, arXiv: 2101.02254 and work in Progress

P. Dimopoulos, F. Di Renzo, J. Goswami, G. Nicotra, C. Schmidt, S. Singh,K. Zambello, F. Ziesché

# Exploring High- $\mu_B$ Probes with rare Probes, ECT\*, Oct 11-15, 2021



Christian Schmidt



Precise determination of the QCD transition temperature  $T_{
m pc} = 156.5 \pm 1.5 \; {
m MeV}$ 

HotQCD: PLB 795 (2019) 15



Christian Schmidt



Precise determination of the QCD transition temperature  $T_{
m pc} = 156.5 \pm 1.5 \; {
m MeV}$ 

HotQCD: PLB 795 (2019) 15

The chiral crossover line with respect to  $\mu_B$   $T_{\rm pc}(\mu_B) = T_{\rm pc}^0 \left( 1 - \kappa_2^{B,f} \left( \frac{\mu_B}{T_{\rm pc}^0} \right)^2 - \kappa_4^{B,f} \left( \frac{\mu_B}{T_{\rm pc}^0} \right)^4 \right)$  $\kappa_2^{B,f} = 0.012(4), \quad \kappa_4^{B,f} = 0.00(4)$ 

HotQCD: PLB 795 (2019) 15

The chiral phase transition temperature and pseudo-critical line  $T_{\rm c} = 132^{+3}_{-6}~{
m MeV}$ 

HotQCD: PRL 123 (2019) 062002



Precise determination of the QCD transition temperature  $T_{
m pc} = 156.5 \pm 1.5 \; {
m MeV}$ 

HotQCD: PLB 795 (2019) 15

The chiral crossover line with respect to  $\mu_B$   $T_{\rm pc}(\mu_B) = T_{\rm pc}^0 \left( 1 - \kappa_2^{B,f} \left( \frac{\mu_B}{T_{\rm pc}^0} \right)^2 - \kappa_4^{B,f} \left( \frac{\mu_B}{T_{\rm pc}^0} \right)^4 \right)$  $\kappa_2^{B,f} = 0.012(4), \quad \kappa_4^{B,f} = 0.00(4)$ 

HotQCD: PLB 795 (2019) 15

The chiral phase transition temperature and pseudo-critical line  $T_{\rm c} = 132^{+3}_{-6} {
m MeV}$ 

HotQCD: PRL 123 (2019) 062002

Expected bounds on the QCD critical end-point

$$T_{
m cep} < T_{
m c} = 132^{+3}_{-6} \; {
m MeV}$$
 $\mu_B^{
m cep} \gtrsim 3 \; T_c$ 

# **Universal behaviour**

Universal critical behaviour guides our thinking on the QCD phase diagram.
 Often considered in the vicinity of the chiral critical point.

$$\frac{p}{T^4} = \frac{1}{VT^3} \ln Z(V, T, \vec{\mu}) = -h^{(2-\alpha)/\beta\delta} \frac{f_f(z)}{f_f(z)} - f_r(V, T, \vec{\mu})$$
Universal scaling function

# Effective model O(4)/O(2)/Z(2):

- 3 relevant scaling fields
  - t reduced temperature
  - *h* reduced symmetry breaking field
  - $L^{-1}$  inverse system size

map QCD to the effective model

controlled by nonuniversal parameter:  $t_0, h_0, l_0$  $T_c, H_c, \kappa_2^B$ 

#### (2+1)-flavor QCD:

$$egin{aligned} egin{aligned} t &= rac{1}{t_0} \left[ \left( rac{T-T_c}{T_c} 
ight) + \kappa_2^B \left( rac{\mu_B}{T} 
ight)^2 
ight] \ h &= rac{1}{h_0} (H-H_c), \quad H = rac{m_l}{m_s} \ l &= l_0 L^{-1} \end{aligned}$$



### **Universal behaviour**

Universal critical behaviour guides our thinking on the QCD phase diagram.
 Often considered in the vicinity of the chiral critical point.

$$\frac{p}{T^4} = \frac{1}{VT^3} \ln Z(V, T, \vec{\mu}) = -h^{(2-\alpha)/\beta\delta} \frac{f_f(z)}{f_f(z)} - f_r(V, T, \vec{\mu})$$
Universal scaling function

We can calculate derivatives of In Z. Singular behaviour is characteristic to the universality class. E.g. here: O(4)

	Magnetic	Mixed	Thermal
O(4)-critical exponents:	$\frac{\partial^2 \ln Z}{\partial d}$	$\partial^2 \ln Z$	$\partial^2 \ln Z$
$\alpha = 0.21$	$\partial h^2$	$\partial h \; \partial t$	$\partial t^2$
lpha=-0.21 eta=-0.38 $\delta=4.82$	$\sim \left(rac{m_l}{m_s} ight)^{1/\delta-1} \ \sim \left(rac{m_l}{m_s} ight)^{-0.79}$	$\sim \left(rac{m_l}{m_s} ight)^{(eta-1)/eta\delta} \ \sim \left(rac{m_l}{m_s} ight)^{-0.34}$	$\sim \left(rac{m_l}{m_s} ight)^{-lpha/eta\delta} \ \sim \left(rac{m_l}{m_s} ight)^{+0.11}$
Dive	rgence: strong	moderate	none
Christian Sch	midt EXPLORING H	IGH-MUR MATTER WITH	

# **Pseudocritical Temperature**

• The order parameter: RG invariant combination of light and strange chiral condensate

$$M \sim rac{\partial f}{\partial H}$$
  $M = 2 \left( m_s \left\langle ar{\psi} \psi \right\rangle_l - m_l \left\langle ar{\psi} \psi \right\rangle_s 
ight) / f_K^4$   
with  $\left\langle ar{\psi} \psi \right\rangle_l = \left( \left\langle ar{\psi} \psi \right\rangle_u + \left\langle ar{\psi} \psi \right\rangle_d 
ight) / 2$   
 $\Rightarrow$  use  $f_K = 156.1(9) / \sqrt{2}$  MeV

The susceptibility: RG-invariant chiral susceptibility

# **Pseudocritical Temperature**





- Transition is a crossover, various definitions of  $T_{pc}$  do not need to agree
- Study 5 different definitions and perform continuum limit
- Find good agreement in the continuum limit:

$$T_{pc} = 156.5 \ (1.5) \ {\rm MeV}$$

A. Bazavov et al [HotQCD], Phys. Lett. B795, 15 (2019), arXiv:1812.08235

#### **Critical Temperature (chiral limit)**



**Christian Schmidt** 

## **Critical Temperature**



**Christian Schmidt** 

# Pseudocritical Temperature at nonzero $\mu_B$



Consider a  $\mu_B$ -dependent shift of the peak of the susceptiblities. Defining conditions are thus

$$\left. \frac{\partial^2 M(T,\mu_B)}{\partial T^2} \right|_{\mu_B} = 0 \quad \text{ or } \left. \left. \frac{\partial \chi_M(T,\mu_B)}{\partial T} \right|_{\mu_B} = 0 \right.$$

The condition lead to equations for  $\kappa_2, \kappa_4$ 

$$egin{split} T_{
m pc}(\mu_B) &= T_{
m pc}^0 \left( 1 - \kappa_2^{B,f} \left( rac{\mu_B}{T_{
m pc}^0} 
ight)^2 - \kappa_4^{B,f} \left( rac{\mu_B}{T_{
m pc}^0} 
ight)^4 
ight) \ \kappa_2^{B,f} &= 0.012(4), \quad \kappa_4^{B,f} = 0.00(4) \end{split}$$

Universal scaling relates derivatives of M

$$t = \frac{1}{t_0} \left[ \left( \frac{T - T_c}{T_c} \right) + \kappa_2^B \left( \frac{\mu_B}{T} \right)^2 \right] \longleftrightarrow \frac{\partial^2}{\partial (\mu_B/T)^2} \simeq \frac{\partial}{\partial T}$$
$$\kappa_2 \sim \frac{T^2 \partial^2 M / \partial \mu_B}{2T \partial M / \partial T} \qquad \text{Karsch et al,}$$
$$arXiv:1009.5211$$

# Pseudocritical Temperature at nonzero $\mu_B$

Universal scaling relates derivatives of M



Curvature of the pseudo critical line depends only mildly on H

**Christian Schmidt** 

#### **Freeze-out line**



 $\kappa_4 = 0.00(4)$ 

B795, 15 (2019), arXiv:1812.08235  $\kappa_4 = 0.00032(67)$ 

S. Borsanyi et al, arXiv: 2002.02821

# The Taylor expansion method

Compute expansion coefficients of the pressure

$$\frac{p}{T^4} = \frac{\ln Z}{T^3 V} = \sum_{i,j,k=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{i!j!k!} \chi_{ijk,0}^{BQS} \left(\frac{\mu_B}{T}\right)^i \left(\frac{\mu_Q}{T}\right)^j \left(\frac{\mu_S}{T}\right)^k$$
  
Gavai, Gupta (2001)  
Bielefeld-Swansea (2002)

Cumulants of conserved charge fluctuations, can also be measured as event-by-event fluctuations in heavy ion collisions

$$\chi^{BQS}_{ijk,0} = \frac{\partial^i}{\partial(\mu_B/T)} \frac{\partial^j}{\partial(\mu_Q/T)} \frac{\partial^k}{\partial(\mu_S/T)} \frac{\ln Z}{T^3 V}$$

⇒ A comparison with experimental data constrain freeze-out parameter

Net baryon number fluctuations diverge at the critical point

$$\Rightarrow$$
 Search for the critical point

# **Cumulant ratios of conserved charge fluctuations**

- Combine quark number fluctuations  $(\chi_{ijk}^{uds})$  to obtain hadronic fluctuations  $(\chi_{ijk}^{BQS})$ .
- Determine strangeness  $(\mu_S/T)$  and electric charge chemical  $(\mu_Q/T)$  potentials by imposing strangeness neutrality  $n_S = 0$  and  $n_Q/n_B = 0.4$  (order by order in the expansion).
- From the pressure expansion we readily obtain the expansions for the n<sup>th</sup>-order cumulants:  $R = \frac{k_{\text{max}}}{\sum} R h = \frac{k_{\text{max}}}{\sum} R h$

$$\chi_n^B(T,\mu_B) = \sum_{k=0}^{max} \tilde{\chi}_n^{B,k}(T)\hat{\mu}_B^k, \text{ with } \hat{\mu}_B = \mu_B/T$$

Define ratios to eliminate the leading order volume dependence

$$R^B_{nm} = rac{\chi^B_n(T,\mu_B)}{\chi^B_m(T,mu_B)} = rac{\sum_{k=0}^{k_{ ext{max}}} ilde{\chi}^{B,k}_n(T) \hat{\mu}^k_B}{\sum_{l=0}^{l_{ ext{max}}} ilde{\chi}^{B,l}_m(T) \hat{\mu}^l_B}$$

In terms of the shape parameters of the distribution we find

$$R_{12} = M/\sigma^2, \; R_{31} = S\sigma^3/M, \; R_{32} = S\sigma, \; R_{42} = \kappa\sigma^2, \; \ldots$$

Eventually we want calculate observables along the crossover (and freeze-out) line, we thus need spline interpolations of our data at discrete temperature values.

#### The expansion coefficients of the pressure



**Christian Schmidt** 

EXPLORING HIGH-MUB MATTER WITH RARE PROBES

18



• Cut-off effects are negligible for  $\mu_B/T \leq 1$  and of the same order as the statistical error at  $N_{ au} = 12$  for  $\mu_B/T \leq 1.2$ .

**Christian Schmidt** 



- Cut-off effects are negligible for  $\mu_B/T \leq 1$  and of the same order as the statistical error at  $N_{\tau} = 12$  for  $\mu_B/T \leq 1.2$ .
- Temperature dependence is very mild. The curvature of the freeze-out line varies the temperature by less than 3 MeV.



- Cut-off effects are negligible for  $\mu_B/T \le 1$  and of the same order as the statistical error at  $N_{ au} = 12$  for  $\mu_B/T \le 1.2$ .
- Temperature dependence is very mild. The curvature of the freeze-out line varies the temperature by less than 3 MeV.
- Continuum extrapolation along the freeze-out line: good agreement with HRG (PDG+QM) up to  $\mu_B \leq 120~{
  m MeV}$

# **Results: Skewness and kurtosis**





- Convergence gets worth with increasing order of the cumulant and with decreasing temperature.
- NLO and NNLO corrections are negative.

# **Results: Skewness and kurtosis**

• Continuum estimates of  $R_{31}^B$  and  $R_{42}^B$  as function of  $\mu_B/T$  for various temperatures.



Ratios drop with increasing  $\mu_B/T$  and with increasing temperature.

# **Results: Skewness and kurtosis**



- Continuum estimates of  $R_{31}^B$ and  $R_{42}^B$  as function of  $R_{12}^B$  on the crossover line.
- Star data at  $\sqrt{s_{NN}} = 54.4 \text{ GeV}$ favors a freeze-out temperature slightly below the crossover.
- The estimate of the freeze-out temperature  $T_{\rm f} = 165$  MeV for  $\sqrt{s_{NN}} = 200$  GeV (from a statistical model analysis) is not consistent with a determination of  $T_{\rm f}$  from the skewness and kurtosis data by STAR.



**Christian Schmidt** 

# **Results:** Fifth and sixth order cumulant ratios $R_{51}^B$ and $R_{62}^B$

# • $R^B_{51}$ and $R^B_{62}$ on $(N_{ au}=8)$ -lattices



- Large statistical uncertainties
- NLO corrections are negative

**EXPLORING HIGH-MUB MATTER WITH RARE PROBES** 

25

# What about the critical point?



- STAR: indication for non-monotonic behaviour in R<sup>P</sup><sub>42</sub> for s<sup>1/2</sup><sub>NN</sub> < 27 GeV with 3.0σ significance [2001.02852].</li>
   ⇒ Hint at the critical point?
- Lattice: would need a reliable  $10^{\text{th-}}$ order calculation to see nonmonotonic behavior in  $R_{42}^B$ .
  - ⇒ Look for a divergence of  $\chi_2^B$ , a zero of  $R_{12}^B$



⇒ Look for poles of  $\chi_2^B$  in the complex plane

**Christian Schmidt** 

EXPLORING HIGH-MUB MATTER WITH RARE PROBES

26

Perform analytic continuation by a multi-point Padé

$$f(x) = \sum_{i=0}^{L} c_i x^i \approx R_n^m(x) = \frac{P_m(x)}{\tilde{Q}_n(x)} = \frac{P_m(x)}{1 + Q_n(x)} = \frac{\sum_{i=0}^{m} a_i x^i}{1 + \sum_{j=1}^{n} b_j x^j}$$

**No surprise:** rational functions can go beyond the radius of convergence, can be used to identify cuts.



Problem: need a large number of Taylor expansion coefficients to high precision

**Christian Schmidt** 

EXPLORING HIGH-MUB MATTER WITH RARE PROBES

m

#### Analytic continuation via multi-point Padé

We can consider multiple Lattice QCD results at purely imaginary chemical potential

**Possible Method:** solve a linear system

#### Example where the multi-point Padé works well: 1D-Thirring



**Figure:** Left: multi-point vs single Padé approximating the function. (Middle) : Reconstruction of the analytic poles by the multi-point Padé and Bottom (Right) : and by the single point Padé

[FdR,KZ,SS, Phys. Rev. D 103, 034513] and [FdR,KZ : arXiv:2109.02511]

S. Singh (Bi-Parma Collaboration), MIT-Lattice colloquium, Oct. 7, 2021

Christian Schmidt

# **Calculations at imaginary chemical potential**

 The fermion determinant stays real at imaginary chemical potential, the imaginary chemical potential is implemented as phases to the time linke link variables

 $U_0(x) 
ightarrow e^{i\hat{\mu}_I} U_0(x) \qquad U_0^\dagger(x) 
ightarrow e^{-i\hat{\mu}_I} U_0^\dagger(x)$ 

Results can be analytically continued to real chemical potential

Taylor in  $Im[\mu_B] \rightarrow Taylor$  in  $Re[\mu_B]$ 

[Borsanyi et al, JHEP 10 (2018) 205]

• The QCD partition function is periodic in  $Im[\mu_B]$  due to the Roberge-Weiss (RW) symmetry, with a periodicity  $2\pi T$ 



Christian Christian Schmidt RING H Criticality in QCD and the HRG PROBES

# **Calculations at imaginary chemical potential**

• Use again (2+1) flavour of HISQ fermions at physical masses. Lattice is still course:  $N_{\tau} = 4.6$ . For simplicity we chose  $\mu_q = \mu_s = \mu_B/3$ 



Expected symmetries are observed

Christian Schmidt

EXPLORING HIGH-MUB MATTER WITH RARE PROBES

30

#### Free energy and analytic continuation



 Free energy develops a nonanalyticity close to the Roberge-Weiss transition



• Analytic continuation of the baryon number density. Without enforcing symmetries, the imaginary part states zero for  $\mu_B/T < 2$ 

# Lee-Yang Edge Singularities

- From Lee-Yang (1952) and Fisher (1978) we know How zeros of the partition functions (poles of susceptibilities) are expected to behave in the vicinity of a critical point.
- The can be found at a universal value of the scaling variable  $z = z_c$ . They indicate the edge of a branch cat in the universal scaling functions.
- The universal value as recently been determined from RG-study, in particular for Z(2), O(2) and O(4)

A. Connelly, G. Johnson, F. Rennecke, and V. Skokov, Phys. Rev. Lett. 125, 191602 (2020), arXiv:2006.12541 [cond-mat.stat-mech].

- Consider universal critical behaviour in the vicinity of the Roberge-Weiss (RW), the chiral transition or even in the vicinity of the QCD critical end-point.
- Data points indicate our preliminary results on the Lee-Yang Edge singularities



Nicotra et al (Bi-Param Collaboration) Lattice 2021

**Christian Schmidt** 

# **Scaling analysis**



 Scaling of the LYE is in accordance with the expected universal behaviour

$$\operatorname{Re}[\mu_B/T] = \pm \pi \left(\frac{z_0}{|z_c|}\right)^{\beta\delta} \left(\frac{T_{RW} - T}{T_{RW}}\right)^{\beta\delta},$$

 $\operatorname{Im}[\mu_B/T] = \pm \pi \,,$ 

#### Chiral transition O(4)

T = 145 MeV



• LEY is at T = 145 MeV is in good agreement with the expected position determined by the nonuniversal parameter previously found by HotQCD:  $T_c$ ,  $k_2$ ,  $z_0$ 

# **Summary and outlook**

- Universal critical behaviour is observed in lattice QCD data and guided our thinking on the QCD phase diagram
- Pseudocritical and critical temperatures as well as some non-universal constants are known to quite some precision.
- The calculation for high order cumulants is numerical very challenging
- Lattice QCD calculations show a significant increase in precision for cumulant ratios along the crossover line in the QCD phase diagram for  $\mu_B/T \leq 1.2$  due to increase in the statistics and thus also the order of the expansion.
- Presented first calculations of  $R_{51}^B$  and  $R_{62}^B$  along the crossover line.
- From preliminary data at imaginary chemical potential we could identify LYE singularities, wich behave also in accordance with the expected universal behaviour

#### Outlook:

- Need to increase statistics for (  $N_{ au} = 12$ )- and (  $N_{ au} = 16$ )-lattices further.
- Investigate resummation schemes to push Taylor expansion results to larger  $\mu_B/T$
- Try to follow LYE to even lower temperature.

# Backup

**Christian Schmidt** 

# The Taylor expansion method

Compute expansion coefficients of the pressure

$$\frac{p}{T^4} = \frac{\ln Z}{T^3 V} = \sum_{i,j,k=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{i!j!k!} \chi^{BQS}_{ijk,0} \left(\frac{\mu_B}{T}\right)^i \left(\frac{\mu_Q}{T}\right)^j \left(\frac{\mu_S}{T}\right)^k$$

Bielefeld-Swansea (2002)

Notation: relevant operators are derivatives of the determinant

$$D_i^f = rac{\partial^i}{\partial \mu_f^i} \mathrm{det} \left[ M_f(\mu_f) 
ight]^{1/4} = rac{\partial^i}{\partial \mu_f^i} e^{rac{1}{4} \mathrm{Tr} \ln M_f(\mu_f)}, \quad f \in \{u, d, s\}$$

up to  $4^{\text{th}}$ -order in  $\mu$ :

exponential dependence:

$$\begin{split} D_{1}^{f} &= \mathrm{Tr} \left[ M_{f}^{-1} M_{f}^{(1)} \right] \\ D_{2}^{f} &= -\mathrm{Tr} \left[ M_{f}^{-1} M_{f}^{(1)} M_{f}^{-1} M_{f}^{(1)} \right] \\ &\quad + \mathrm{Tr} \left[ M_{f}^{-1} M_{f}^{(2)} \right] \\ &\quad \vdots \end{split}$$

from 6<sup>th</sup>-order in  $\mu$  onwards:

linear dependence:  

$$D_{1}^{f} = \operatorname{Tr} \left[ M_{f}^{-1} M_{f}^{(1)} \right]$$

$$D_{2}^{f} = -\operatorname{Tr} \left[ M_{f}^{-1} M_{f}^{(1)} M_{f}^{-1} M_{f}^{(1)} \right]$$
all  $M_{f}^{(k)} = 0$ , for k>1  
 $\rightarrow$  much less operators to measure!

⇒ much less operators to measure! Gavai, Sharma 2015

#### EXPLORING HIGH-MUB MATTER WITH RARE PROBES

3

# Lattice setup and statistics

- Use (2+1)-flavor of HISQ-fermions, with physical strange and light quark masses.
- Lattices sizes are  $32^3 \times 8$ ,  $48^3 \times 12$ ,  $64^3 \times 16$ , at 9 different temperature values.
- Statistics: Compared to our previous analysis of skewness and kurtosis [HotQCD, PRD 96 (2017) 074510] we increased the statistics on  $(N_{\tau} = 8)$ -lattices by a factor 3-4 and on  $(N_{\tau} = 12)$ -lattices by a factor 6-8. I.e. we have now

- Order of the expansion: We can now go to N<sup>3</sup>LO, compared to NLO in our previous study. I.e., we include 8-th order expansion coefficients of the pressure.
- Recent Calculations were performed on Summit, using Nvidia's V100 GPU's.





- $R^B_{51}$  and  $R^B_{62}$  on  $(N_{ au}=8)$ -lattices
  - Not consistent with STAR data: A. Pandav@SQM19  $\sqrt{s_{NN}} = 200 \text{ GeV}: R_{62}^P < 0$

 $\sqrt{s_{NN}}=54.4~{
m GeV}$ :  $R^P_{62}>0$ 

➡ Lattice QCD predictions

$\sqrt{s_{NN}}$	$R^B_{51}$	$R^B_{62}$
200	-0.5(3)	-0.7(3)
54.4	-0.7(4)	-2(1)

38

**Christian Schmidt** 

#### Bielefeld-Parma (preliminary)



- Obtain zeros of the numerator and denominator
- Some zeros match to high precision, for others its not so clear...
- The RW-singularity seems to be stable
- Other singularities need further investigations...work in progress.
- Singularities may also be understood in terms of the Fourier coefficients of the  ${\rm Im}[\chi_1^B]$

[Vovchenko et al, PRD 97, 114030 (2018)]

39

[Almási et al, PRD 100, 016016 (2019)]

[Almási et al, PLB 793 (2019)]