## Using Gradient Flow to Renormalise Matrix Elements for $B$ Meson Mixing and Lifetimes

Matthew Black

In collaboration with:
R. Harlander, F. Lange, A. Rago, A. Shindler, O. Witzel

March 20, 2023


## Universität Siegen

> $B$-meson mixing and lifetimes are measured experimentally to high precision
$\Rightarrow$ Key observables for probing New Physics $\Rightarrow$ high precision in theory needed!


## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes
> $B$-meson mixing and lifetimes are measured experimentally to high precision
$\boldsymbol{\bullet}$ Key observables for probing New Physics $\boldsymbol{\boldsymbol { \sigma }}$ high precision in theory needed!


## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes
Matthew Black
> $B$-meson mixing and lifetimes are measured experimentally to high precision
$\Leftrightarrow$ Key observables for probing New Physics $\boldsymbol{\Rightarrow}$ high precision in theory needed!


## Using GF to Renormalise <br> Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

> $B$-meson mixing and lifetimes are measured experimentally to high precision
$\Rightarrow$ Key observables for probing New Physics $\Rightarrow$ high precision in theory needed!

- For lifetimes and decay rates, we use the Heavy Quark Expansion

$$
\Gamma_{B_{q}}=\Gamma_{3}\left\langle\mathcal{O}_{D=3}\right\rangle+\Gamma_{5} \frac{\left\langle\mathcal{O}_{D=5}\right\rangle}{m_{b}^{2}}+\Gamma_{6} \frac{\left\langle\mathcal{O}_{D=6}\right\rangle}{m_{b}^{3}}+\ldots+16 \pi^{2}\left[\tilde{\Gamma}^{\frac{\left\langle\tilde{\mathcal{O}}_{D=6}\right\rangle}{m_{b}^{3}}}+\tilde{\Gamma}_{7} \frac{\left\langle\tilde{\mathcal{O}}_{D=7}\right\rangle}{m_{b}^{4}}+\ldots\right]
$$


> Factorise observables into $\Rightarrow$ perturbative QCD contributions
$\Rightarrow$ Non-Perturbative Matrix Elements

## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

- Four-quark $\Delta B=0$ and $\Delta B=2$ matrix elements can be determined from lattice QCD simulations
> $\Delta B=2$ well-studied by several groups $\Rightarrow$ precision increasing, but some tension
$\Rightarrow \Delta K=2$ for Kaon mixing already studied with gradient flow [Suzuki et al. '20]
> $\Delta B=0 \Rightarrow$ exploratory studies from $\sim 20$ years ago + new developments for lifetime ratios
$\Rightarrow$ contributions from disconnected diagrams
$\Rightarrow$ mixing with lower dimension operators in renormalisation


## Using GF to Renormalise

- Four-quark $\Delta B=0$ and $\Delta B=2$ matrix elements can be determined from lattice QCD simulations
> $\Delta B=2$ well-studied by several groups $\Rightarrow$ precision increasing, but some tension
$\Leftrightarrow \Delta K=2$ for Kaon mixing already studied with gradient flow [Suzuki et al. '20]
> $\Delta B=0 \Rightarrow$ exploratory studies from $\sim 20$ years ago + new developments for lifetime ratios
[Lin, Detmold, Meinel '22]
$\Rightarrow$ contributions from disconnected diagrams
$\Rightarrow$ mixing with lower dimension operators in renormalisation

1. Verify procedure with $\Delta B=2$ matrix elements against other calculations
2. Pioneer connected $\Delta B=0$ matrix element calculation with gradient flow renormalisation scheme
3. Resolve disconnected contributions

## Using GF to Renormalise Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

> Mass difference of neutral mesons $\Delta M_{q}(q=d, s)$ governed by $\Delta B=2$ four-quark operators

- Standard 'SUSY' operator basis

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
\mathcal{O}_{1}^{q}=\bar{b}^{\alpha} \gamma^{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha} \bar{b}^{\beta} \gamma_{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\beta}, & \left\langle\mathcal{O}_{1}^{q}\right\rangle=\left\langle\bar{B}_{q}\right| \mathcal{O}_{1}^{q}\left|B_{q}\right\rangle=\frac{8}{3} f_{B_{q}}^{2} M_{B_{q}}^{2} B_{1}^{q} \\
\mathcal{O}_{2}^{q}=\bar{b}^{\alpha}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha} \bar{b}^{\beta}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\beta}, & \left\langle\mathcal{O}_{2}^{q}\right\rangle=\left\langle\bar{B}_{q}\right| \mathcal{O}_{2}^{q}\left|B_{q}\right\rangle=\frac{-5 M_{B_{q}}^{2}}{3\left(m_{b}+m_{q}\right)^{2}} f_{B_{q}}^{2} M_{B_{q}}^{2} B_{2}^{q}, \\
\mathcal{O}_{3}^{q}=\bar{b}^{\alpha}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\beta} \bar{b}^{\beta}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha}, & \left\langle\mathcal{O}_{3}^{q}\right\rangle=\left\langle\bar{B}_{q}\right| \mathcal{O}_{3}^{q}\left|B_{q}\right\rangle=\frac{M_{B_{q}}^{2}}{3\left(m_{b}+m_{q}\right)^{2}} f_{B_{q}}^{2} M_{B_{q}}^{2} B_{3}^{q}, \\
\mathcal{O}_{4}^{q}=\bar{b}^{\alpha}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha} \bar{b}^{\beta}\left(1+\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\beta}, & \left\langle\mathcal{O}_{4}^{q}\right\rangle=\left\langle\bar{B}_{q}\right| \mathcal{O}_{4}^{q}\left|B_{q}\right\rangle=\left[\frac{2 M_{B_{q}}^{2}}{\left(m_{b}+m_{q}\right)^{2}}+\frac{1}{3}\right] f_{B_{q}}^{2} M_{B_{q}}^{2} B_{4}^{q} \\
\mathcal{O}_{5}^{q}=\bar{b}^{\alpha}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\beta} \bar{b}^{\beta}\left(1+\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha}, & \left\langle\mathcal{O}_{5}^{q}\right\rangle=\left\langle\bar{B}_{q}\right| \mathcal{O}_{5}^{q}\left|B_{q}\right\rangle=\left[\frac{2 M_{B_{q}}^{2}}{3\left(m_{b}+m_{q}\right)^{2}}+1\right] f_{B_{q}}^{2} M_{B_{q}}^{2} B_{5}^{q}
\end{array}
$$

> Matrix elements parameterised in terms of decay constant $f_{B_{q}}$ and bag parameters $B_{i}^{q}$

## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

- HPQCD and FNAL/MILC choose perturbative renormalisation + matching schemes
$>$ RBC/UKQCD set up a non-perturbative renormalisation (NPR) $\Rightarrow$ transform operator basis

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathcal{Q}_{1}^{q}=\bar{b}^{\alpha} \gamma^{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha} \bar{b}^{\beta} \gamma_{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\beta}, \\
& \mathcal{Q}_{2}^{q}=\bar{b}^{\alpha} \gamma^{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha} \bar{b}^{\beta} \gamma_{\mu}\left(1+\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\beta}, \\
& \mathcal{Q}_{3}^{q}=\bar{b}^{\alpha}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha} \bar{b}^{\beta}\left(1+\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\beta}, \\
& \mathcal{Q}_{4}^{q}=\bar{b}^{\alpha}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha} \bar{b}^{\beta}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\beta}, \\
& \mathcal{Q}_{5}^{q}=\frac{1}{4} \bar{b}^{\alpha} \sigma_{\mu \nu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha} \bar{b}^{\beta} \sigma_{\mu \nu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\beta}
\end{aligned} \quad\left(\begin{array}{c}
\mathcal{O}_{1}^{+} \\
\mathcal{O}_{2}^{+} \\
\mathcal{O}_{3}^{+} \\
\mathcal{O}_{4}^{+} \\
\mathcal{O}_{5}^{+}
\end{array}\right)=\left(\begin{array}{ccccc}
1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & -\frac{1}{2} & \frac{1}{2} \\
0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & -\frac{1}{2} & 0 & 0 & 0
\end{array}\right)\left(\begin{array}{c}
\mathcal{Q}_{1}^{+} \\
\mathcal{Q}_{2}^{+} \\
\mathcal{Q}_{3}^{+} \\
\mathcal{Q}_{4}^{+} \\
\mathcal{Q}_{5}^{+}
\end{array}\right)
$$

- Advantages for both lattice calculation and the NPR procedure
> Only colour-singlet operators now appear
- We are only concerned with parity-even components which then can be transformed back to SUSY basis


## Using GF to Renormalise Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

## Current Status: $\Delta B=2$ Matrix Elements (Lattice)

Matrix elements are calculated directly from lattice simulations

$$
\left\langle\mathcal{O}_{i}^{q}\right\rangle \Rightarrow f_{B_{q}}^{2} B_{i}^{q} \Rightarrow B_{i}^{q}
$$

$>\left[\right.$ FLAG '21] reports on $\left\langle\mathcal{O}_{1}^{q}\right\rangle \Rightarrow$ tension between most recent $2+1$ and $2+1+1$ calculations:

$$
\begin{aligned}
N_{f}=2+1: & f_{B_{s}} \sqrt{\hat{B}_{1}^{s}}=274(8) \mathrm{MeV},[\text { FNAL/MILC '16] } \\
N_{f}=2+1+1: & f_{B_{s}} \sqrt{\hat{B}_{1}^{s}}=256.1(5.7) \mathrm{MeV}[\mathrm{HPQCD}
\end{aligned}
$$

$>\left\langle\mathcal{O}_{2-5}^{d, s}\right\rangle$ determined for $N_{f}=2\left[\right.$ ETM '13] and $N_{f}=2+1[$ FNAL/MILC '16]
$\Rightarrow$ Work in progress by RBC/UKQCD + JLQCD at $N_{f}=2+1$ [Boyle et al. '18], [Boyle et al. '21]
$\Rightarrow$ we use same setup as RBC/UKQCD for comparisons later

- First lattice calculations for $\operatorname{dim}-7\left\langle R_{2,3}^{q}\right\rangle$ and $\left\langle\widetilde{R}_{2,3}\right\rangle$ from [HPQCD '19B]
$\Rightarrow$ Suffers from large uncertainties e.g. from matching to continuum regularisation scheme


## Using GF to Renormalise Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

> Formulated by [Lüscher '10], [Lüscher '13] $\Rightarrow$ scale setting, RG $\beta$-function, renormalisation...

- Introduce auxiliary dimension, flow time $t$ as a way to regularise the UV
- Extend gauge and fermion fields in flow time and express dependence with first-order differential equations:

$$
\begin{aligned}
\partial_{t} B_{\mu}(t, x) & =\mathcal{D}_{\nu}(t) G_{\nu \mu}(t, x), & B_{\mu}(0, x) & =A_{\mu}(x), \\
\partial_{t} \chi(t, x) & =\mathcal{D}^{2}(t) \chi(t, x), & \chi(0, x) & =q(x)
\end{aligned}
$$

> Re-express effective Hamiltonian in terms of 'flowed' operators:

$$
\mathcal{H}_{\text {eff }}=\sum_{n} C_{n} \mathcal{O}_{n}=\sum_{n} \tilde{C}_{n}(t) \tilde{\mathcal{O}}_{n}(t)
$$

- Relate to regular operators in 'small-flow-time expansion':



## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

For a set of lattice ensembles with varying bare parameters


## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

For a set of lattice ensembles with varying bare parameters


## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes
> We will consider RBC/UKQCD's $2+1$ flavour DWF + Iwasaki gauge action ensembles

|  | $L$ | $T$ | $a^{-1} / \mathrm{GeV}$ | $a m_{l}^{\text {sea }}$ | $a m_{s}^{\text {sea }}$ | $M_{\pi} / \mathrm{MeV}$ | srcs $\times \mathrm{N}_{\text {conf }}$ |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| C1 | 24 | 64 | 1.785 | 0.005 | 0.040 | 340 | $32 \times 101$ |
| C2 | 24 | 64 | 1.785 | 0.010 | 0.040 | 433 |  |
| M1 | 32 | 64 | 2.383 | 0.004 | 0.030 | 302 |  |
| M2 | 32 | 64 | 2.383 | 0.006 | 0.030 | 362 |  |
| M3 | 32 | 64 | 2.383 | 0.008 | 0.030 | 411 |  |
| F1S | 48 | 96 | 2.785 | 0.002144 | 0.02144 | 267 |  |

[Allton et al. '08] [Aoki et al. '10]
[Blum et al. '14] [Boyle et al. '17]
> Exploratory simulations only on C1 with single set of valence parameters so far

## Using GF to Renormalise Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

- We will consider RBC/UKQCD's $2+1$ flavour DWF + Iwasaki gauge action ensembles
- Fully-relativistic DWF for all valence quarks [Shamir '93] [Iwasaki, Yoshie '84] [lwasaki '85]


## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

- We will consider RBC/UKQCD's $2+1$ flavour DWF + Iwasaki gauge action ensembles
- Fully-relativistic DWF for all valence quarks [Shamir '93] [lwasaki, Yoshie '84] [lwasaki '85]

Fully-relativistic DWF for all valence quarks

- For strange quarks tuned to physical value, $a m_{q} \ll 1 \checkmark$
- For heavy $b$ quarks, $a m_{q}>1 \Rightarrow$ large discretisation effects $\boldsymbol{X}$
> To simulate $b$ quarks on current lattices:


## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

- We will consider RBC/UKQCD's $2+1$ flavour DWF + Iwasaki gauge action ensembles
- Fully-relativistic DWF for all valence quarks [Shamir '93] [lwasaki, Yoshie '84] [lwasaki '85]
- For strange quarks tuned to physical value, $a m_{q} \ll 1$
$\rightarrow$ For heavy $b$ quarks, $a m_{q}>1 \Rightarrow$ large discretisation effects $X$
- To simulate $b$ quarks on current lattices:
$\Leftrightarrow$ Extrapolate from multiple charm-like masses
$\Rightarrow a m_{h} \sim 0.3-0.7$ with stout smearing of gauge fields [Morningstar, Peardon '03]


## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

- We will consider RBC/UKQCD's $2+1$ flavour DWF + Iwasaki gauge action ensembles
- Fully-relativistic DWF for all valence quarks [Shamir '93] [Iwasaki, Yoshie '84] [Iwasaki '85]
- For strange quarks tuned to physical value, $a m_{q} \ll 1$
> For heavy $b$ quarks, $a m_{q}>1 \Rightarrow$ large discretisation effects $\boldsymbol{X}$
> To simulate $b$ quarks on current lattices:
$\Rightarrow$ Extrapolate from multiple charm-like masses
$\Rightarrow a m_{h} \sim 0.3-0.7$ with stout smearing of gauge fields [Morningstar, Peardon '03]
- Z2 wall sources for all quark propagators [Boyle et al. '08]
$\Rightarrow$ Sources for strange propagators are also Gaussian smeared [Allton et al. '93]
- Calculate non-eye weak 3-point functions


## Using GF to Renormalise <br> Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

- We will consider RBC/UKQCD's $2+1$ flavour DWF + Iwasaki gauge action ensembles
- Fully-relativistic DWF for all valence quarks
> For strange quarks tuned to physical value, $a m_{q} \ll 1$
> For heavy $b$ quarks, $a m_{q}>1 \Rightarrow$ large discretisation effects $\boldsymbol{X}$
> To simulate $b$ quarks on current lattices:
$\Rightarrow$ Extrapolate from multiple charm-like masses




## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes
> Valence simulations carried out using Hadrons [Portelli et al. '22]
> Gauge Flow
$\Leftrightarrow$ Runge-Kutta scheme for small step size $\epsilon$
$\Leftrightarrow$ Pre-existing implementation of Wilson action gauge flow in Grid [Boyle et al. '15]
$\Leftrightarrow$ Re-implemented into Hadrons also with Symanzik and Zeuthen actions

- Fermion Flow
$\Leftrightarrow$ Uses gauge flow implementation with Wilson action
$\Rightarrow$ Evolve propagators with 4D Laplacian in Runge-Kutta scheme
- Gauge and fermion fields evolved with $\epsilon=0.01$
> Measurements taken every 10 steps for $t / a^{2}<5$


## Using GF to Renormalise Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

> We want to find suitable window in flow time
$\Rightarrow$ May be different for different quantities
> Look at different quantities and their behaviour with the flow
$\Rightarrow$ 2-point functions $\Rightarrow$ effective mass, decay amplitude

$$
M^{\mathrm{eff}}(t)=\cosh ^{-1}\left(\frac{C_{P P}(t)+C_{P P}(t+2)}{2 C_{P P}(t+1)}\right) \quad \Phi^{\mathrm{eff}}(t)=\sqrt{2} \frac{\left|C_{A P}(t)\right|}{\sqrt{C_{P P}(t) e^{-M t}}}
$$

$\Rightarrow$ 3-point functions
$\Rightarrow$ 3-point/2-point ratios $\Rightarrow$ approximate to Bag parameters

$$
R_{1}=\frac{C_{\mathcal{O}_{1}}^{3 \mathrm{pt}}(t, \Delta t)}{C_{A P}^{2 \mathrm{pt}}(t) C_{P A}^{2 \mathrm{pt}}(\Delta T-t)} \quad R_{i}=\frac{C_{\mathcal{O}_{i}}^{3 \mathrm{pt}}(t, \Delta t)}{C_{P P}^{2 \mathrm{pt}}(t) C_{P P}^{2 \mathrm{pt}}(\Delta T-t)}, i=2 \rightarrow 5
$$

## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes


- Flow acts on effective mass as sink smearing
> Excited states suppressed at earlier time slices
- Ground state effective mass should not change
- Large flow time will destroy the ground state


## Using GF to Renormalise <br> Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes



## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes


## Using GF to Renormalise <br> Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes



## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes


- Expect similar behaviour to effective mass
- Value of ground state decay amplitude will change


## Using GF to Renormalise <br> Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes



## Using GF to Renormalise <br> Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes



## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes


## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes
Matthew Black


- Ground state should change but how?
> At large flow time, smearing of sources overlaps with 3pt ground state
> Different $\Delta T$ will have different windows


## Using GF to Renormalise <br> Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes



## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes


## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes


## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes
Matthew Black


## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes


## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes


## Using GF to Renormalise <br> Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes



## Using GF to Renormalise

Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes
Matthew Black
$>\Delta B=0$ four-quark matrix elements are strongly-desired quantities needed in predictions of $B$ meson lifetimes
$\Leftrightarrow$ Standard renormalisation introduces mixing with operators of lower mass dimension
$\Leftrightarrow$ We aim to use the fermionic gradient flow as a non-perturbative renormalisation procedure
> Testing method first with well-studied $\Delta B=2$ matrix elements for $B$ meson mixing and decay constants

- Implemented the fermionic flow in Hadrons, plus gauge flow for Symanzik and Zeuthen actions
> Shown first simulations for $\Delta B=2$


## Next Steps:

> Simulate at multiple heavy quark masses on all ensembles

- Extrapolate to physical heavy mesons + continuum limits at each $t$ in 'small-flow-time' region
> Combine with perturbative matching matrix $\Rightarrow$ final results at $t=0$ in $\overline{\mathrm{MS}}$
> Repeat analysis for quark-line connected $\Delta B=0$ matrix elements
Consider disconnected contributions


## Using GF to Renormalise Matrix Elements for $B$ Mixing and Lifetimes

- For lifetimes, the dimension-6 $\Delta B=0$ operators are:

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
Q_{1}^{q}=\bar{b}^{\alpha} \gamma^{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha} \bar{q}^{\beta} \gamma_{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) b^{\beta}, & \left\langle Q_{1}^{q}\right\rangle=\left\langle B_{q}\right| Q_{1}^{q}\left|B_{q}\right\rangle=f_{B_{q}}^{2} M_{B_{q}}^{2} \mathcal{B}_{1}^{q}, \\
Q_{2}^{q}=\bar{b}^{\alpha}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha} \bar{q}^{\beta}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) b^{\beta}, & \left\langle Q_{2}^{q}\right\rangle=\left\langle B_{q}\right| Q_{2}^{q}\left|B_{q}\right\rangle=\frac{M_{B_{q}}^{2}}{\left(m_{b}+m_{q}\right)^{2}} f_{B_{q}}^{2} M_{B_{q}}^{2} \mathcal{B}_{2}^{q}, \\
T_{1}^{q}=\bar{b}^{\alpha} \gamma^{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right)\left(T^{a}\right)^{\alpha \beta} q^{\beta} \bar{q}^{\gamma} \gamma_{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right)\left(T^{a}\right)^{\gamma \delta} b^{\delta}, & \left\langle T_{1}^{q}\right\rangle=\left\langle B_{q}\right| T_{1}^{q}\left|B_{q}\right\rangle=f_{B_{q}}^{2} M_{B_{q}}^{2} \epsilon_{1}^{q} \\
T_{2}^{q}=\bar{b}^{\alpha}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right)\left(T^{a}\right)^{\alpha \beta} q^{\beta} \bar{q}^{\gamma}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right)\left(T^{a}\right)^{\gamma \delta} b^{\delta}, & \left\langle T_{2}^{q}\right\rangle=\left\langle B_{q}\right| T_{2}^{q}\left|B_{q}\right\rangle=\frac{M_{B_{q}}^{2}}{\left(m_{b}+m_{q}\right)^{2}} f_{B_{q}}^{2} M_{B_{q}}^{2} \epsilon_{2}^{q}
\end{array}
$$

> For simplicity of computation, we again want these all to be colour-singlet operators:

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathcal{Q}_{1} & =\bar{b}^{\alpha} \gamma_{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha} \bar{q}^{\beta} \gamma_{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) b^{\beta} \\
\mathcal{Q}_{2} & \left.=\bar{b}^{\alpha}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\alpha} \bar{q}^{\beta}\left(1+\gamma_{5}\right) b^{\beta}\right) \\
\tau_{1} & =\bar{b}^{\alpha} \gamma_{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) b^{\alpha} \bar{q}^{\beta} \gamma_{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\beta} \\
\tau_{2} & =\bar{b}^{\alpha} \gamma_{\mu}\left(1+\gamma_{5}\right) b^{\alpha} \bar{q}^{\beta} \gamma_{\mu}\left(1-\gamma_{5}\right) q^{\beta}
\end{aligned} \quad\left(\begin{array}{c}
Q_{1}^{+} \\
Q_{2}^{+} \\
T_{1}^{+} \\
T_{2}^{+}
\end{array}\right)=\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
1 & 0 & 0 \\
0 \\
0 & 1 & 0 \\
0 \\
-\frac{1}{2 N_{c}} & 0 & -\frac{1}{2} \\
0 & -\frac{1}{2 N_{c}} & 0 \\
\frac{1}{4}
\end{array}\right)\left(\begin{array}{c}
\mathcal{Q}_{1}^{+} \\
\mathcal{Q}_{2}^{+} \\
\tau_{1}^{+} \\
\tau_{2}^{+}
\end{array}\right)
$$

## Using GF to Renormalise

